

'the Anglicans [who] meddle in politics and condemn our policy.' His particular trio of hate-figures comprised Huddleston, Reeves and Scott.

Scott's partisans were no less categorical. Arthur Blaxall, the Secretary of the Christian Council of South Africa, spoke of Scott as 'almost idolized by thousands of depressed people'. This because Scott, unlike other white priests, was prepared to share the poor conditions endured by Indians and Africans. Huddleston confessed that 'I was a pretty cautious political racketeer. I had nothing like the guts of Michael Scott.' And many women found him intensely attractive. But an episode of sexual abuse at his preparatory school crippled his capacity for marriage, and he kept his long relationships with Mary Benson and Laura Richmond strictly platonic. One admirer is curiously absent from the book: Patrick Duncan, the South African Liberal Party campaigner against apartheid. Duncan, like Scott, was a devout Anglican and a disciple of Gandhi's doctrine of non-violent resistance. Whereas Duncan in the 1960s swung over to an acceptance of armed revolution, Scott remained committed to satyagraha. Thus for all the attacks on Scott's activism, others such as Duncan (and Nelson Mandela) moved into positions much more extreme than his.

*The Troublemaker* has a complicated authorship. The *Observer* journalist Cyril Dunn began the biography in the 1970s. It was subsequently taken over by Anne Yates, who distilled the essence from the voluminous Scott Papers in Rhodes House Library, Oxford, and wrote most of a first draft. She died in 2000, to be replaced by Lewis Chester, another experienced journalist and writer. In consequence, it is impossible to assign respective credit, but there is no doubt that Chester has done a highly professional job to consummate what Dunn and Yates began. The style is beautifully succinct: time and again a tangled issue is elegantly encapsulated in a sentence or two. And the book is soundly based on a rich variety of sources. Quite apart from the huge mass of the Scott Papers, it draws on the Africa Bureau Collection at Rhodes House and on interesting material from the National Archive at Kew. Added to this are revelations from extensive interviews conducted by Dunn, and by both Yates and Chester. This is a work which recognizes that its subject was not quite the saint some thought him, and it is difficult to see how it can be significantly bettered. It is an absorbing tribute to a remarkable man.

*St Giles' Croft, Beverley*

JOHN MAJOR

doi:10.1093/afraf/adm033

Advance Access Publication 26 June 2007

**(Un)thinking Citizenship: Feminist debates in contemporary South Africa**, edited by Amanda Gouws. Aldershot and Burlington, VT: Ashgate Publishing, 2004. xiii + 281 pp. £50 (hardback). ISBN 0-7546-3878-2 (hardback).

What does it mean to be a citizen in a society whose constitution promises an impressive array of rights, yet where the lived reality is one of pervasive violence, fear, poverty and HIV/AIDS? The diverse array of practitioner and activist authors in this collection are insistent that it means liberal citizenship is insufficient.

In the opening essay, Linzi Manicom argues that neither substantive rights nor women-as-citizens directly undermine gender or its effects. Alternatively, she suggests feminists not only examine how 'women' are discursively constituted as political subjects, but also decipher the political impact of such

constructions. Manicom identifies three discourses of gendered citizenship in South Africa—de-gendered individual rights-bearing subjects, women-as-citizen and mother-citizens of the nation. She warns feminists to be attentive to ways in which articulation(s) of citizenship—even those that embrace equal rights—can be essentializing and can be mobilized to promote elite interests, re-inscribing existing divisions among women.

Shireen Hassim's contribution analyses how citizenship trumped nationalist discourses to become a dominant political ideal during the South African transition to democracy. She provides the historical backdrop to Manicom's contemporary critique, reminding us that 'women-as-citizen' was constructed by a wide range of South African women who were divided not only by race and class, but also by political ideology. As a result, they built their discursive framework on a thin notion of sisterhood: exclusion from the transition negotiations.

The remaining articles in the collection give traction to Manicom's claim that South Africans continue to be biologically reductionist and that citizenship is no longer an optimal strategy for advancing women's emancipation. Amanda Gouws argues that the women's movement at the center of Hassim's account has been depoliticized by a 'technocratic' statist discourse that continues to equate gender with 'women' who are stripped of agency, defined as victims in need of protective rights. If women are victims and men political agents, Daniel Conway demonstrates that men's efforts at discursive transformation are also limited when framed as a struggle for inclusion. Conway notes that under the apartheid regime conscientious objectors to compulsory military service insisted that they remained loyal citizens. The strategy of inclusion limited their discursive challenge, sustaining both republican and heteronormative assumptions of apartheid citizenship.

The next section of the book pursues an expanded vision of rights through substantive implementation. Beth Goldblatt provides an insightful legal analysis of citizenship in the South African constitution. Danwood Mzikenge Chirwa and Sibonile Khoza evaluate the current justiciability (that is whether a claim is liable to be tried in a court of justice; whether it is subject to jurisdiction) of economic and social rights. Finally in this section, Anneke Meerkotter analyses the role of social movements and the courts in securing the rights of HIV/AIDS survivors. Yet, in seeking to expand the benefits of the existing system the authors neglect to address the dismantling of gender and the processes that sustain it.

The next section uncovers women's agency in sites that are often overlooked. Cheryl McEwan's focus on local governance reveals that the barriers hindering women's political participation are reinforced by hierarchal, bureaucratic structures that ignore disadvantage, confining women's participation to informal political forums. Gertrude Fester's contribution provides evidence that motherist movements in the Western Cape not only addressed women's practical interests, but occasionally advanced women's strategic interests as well. Like McEwan, she argues that women's emancipatory activism has been underestimated although it remains insufficient.

The last section—on sexualizing citizenship—contains a strong theoretical contribution by Mikki van Zyl. In tandem with Manicom's project, van Zyl reveals the essentialized gendered/sexual underpinnings of citizenship in South Africa and uncovers how that citizenship is constructed. Although van Zyl strongly rejects the 'heteronormative bondage' of liberal citizenship, she is one of the few contributors to note its critical role in opening an arena for public contestation over definitions and identity. The final contribution, by Louise du Toit, challenges the South African legal assumption that rape is a crime committed by men against women.

She argues rape is akin to torture, a torture that violently re-inscribes masculinity and femininity, destroying a survivor's capacity to claim or exercise citizenship.

One of the central aims of this collection is to develop feminist theory and challenge Anglo-American hegemony in that field. While not all contributors meet that editorial goal in full, each author provides strong evidence that feminist critiques of liberal citizenship are well founded, each is clearly aware of these limitations and all are thinking beyond them.

Like most collections of this kind the essays are a bit uneven. A few contributions overlap with earlier published work, and several articles would benefit by engaging with more recent feminist theory. Despite these shortcomings, the collection will undoubtedly be an invaluable resource for scholars, graduate students and activists interested in exploring the limits of liberal citizenship in a developing democracy.

*University of Virginia*

DENISE WALSH

doi:10.1093/afraf/adm034

Advance Access Publication 26 June 2007

**Battling Terrorism in the Horn of Africa**, edited by Robert I. Rotberg. Cambridge, MA and Washington, DC: World Peace Foundation and Brookings Institution Press, 2005. 195 pp. £11.99 (paperback). ISBN 13-978-0-8157-7571-3 (paperback).

**US Foreign Policy and the Horn of Africa**, by Peter Woodward. Aldershot and Burlington: Ashgate, 2006. 178 pp. £55.00. ISBN 0-7546-3580-5 (hardback).

The number of books and articles in academic journals on Islamism in the Horn of Africa has been rising since 9/11 and particularly since October 2002 when the USA created a Combined Joint Task Force for the Horn of Africa (CJTF-HOA). The CJTF-HOA operates in seven countries: Kenya, Somalia, Sudan, Djibouti, Ethiopia, Eritrea and Yemen as part of an overall anti-terrorism cooperation strategy with these states. Taken together, the two books under review provide a significant addition to this literature.

*Battling Terrorism in the Horn of Africa* treats the region as a front-line in the 'war against terrorism'. The case studies provide interesting analysis substantiated with original empirical evidence on the interplay between domestic, regional and extra-regional dynamics. However, the contributors do not offer clear conclusions that confirm the ascendancy of an Islamist threat. As the editor, Robert Rotberg, notes 'actual al-Qa'ida operatives and sleepers in this region are few in 2005' (p. 2). Even so the editor still claims that they are dangerous, as was demonstrated by the terrorist acts perpetrated by militant Islamists with links to al-Qa'ida in the region before 9/11.

Some of the authors present evidence that shows the shortfalls of the current American approach. As Burrowes rightly points out with regard to Yemen, the military emphasis in the 'war on terrorism' is counterproductive because it fails to address the socio-economic and political dimensions of the problem (p. 165). Carney's chapter on Sudan also shows the pitfalls of US strategy: there is a lack of focus on effective diplomatic presence, a lack of expertise on domestic and regional politics and a reliance on regional states' intelligence services.

The case studies should be considered separately, as the standards of analysis and of empirical evidence vary significantly. The chapters on Somalia and Somaliland